

## **Pakistani Bureaucracy: Crisis of Governance, Prospects and Recommended Reforms**

by

**Nabila Aftab<sup>1</sup>**

M.Phil Scholar, Hazara University, Mansehra, Pakistan  
Email: [nabilaaftab123@gmail.com](mailto:nabilaaftab123@gmail.com)

**Muhammad Fahim Khan**

M.Phil Scholar, Hazara University, Mansehra, Pakistan.  
Email: [fahimkhanjadoon86@gmail.com](mailto:fahimkhanjadoon86@gmail.com)  
Ph: +923339827170

**Shujahat Ali**

M.Phil Scholar, Hazara University, Mansehra, Pakistan  
Email: [shujahat22@gmail.com](mailto:shujahat22@gmail.com)  
Ph: +92 331 9089315

### **Abstract**

This article describes the complexities and essence of Pakistan's bureaucratic administration under different periods including some Colonial Era Note. This addresses the traditions and standards of British Raj's famous 'steel administration frame.' Bureaucracy involved itself in politics and defied Quaid-i-Azam's golden sayings. After Pakistan became an independent country, the colonial legacy of bureaucratic primacy culminated in the politicisation of bureaucracy. Bureaucratic bonhomie has contributed to systemic decline executive decision taking, corruption allegations, shoot-back culture, tax-seeking conduct and unaccountability, and so on. The study seeks to explain the gray areas in Pakistan's bureaucracy with the aim of recommending changes to reduce bureaucracy politization, incremental systemic collapse, strangling federal and provincial infrastructure, and encouraging accountability culture to achieve the prized goal of 21st-century developed Pakistan.

**Keywords:** Pakistan, autocracy, governance, reforms, bureaucratic administration.

### **Introduction:**

At the beginning, it is important to know the word governance that multiple authors have described separately. We say it guides and regulates public affairs. Governance applies to the creation and custodianship of the formal and informal rules governing the public sphere, the forum

---

<sup>1</sup> Corresponding author

in which both state and social and economic actors work to create decisions (Hygen and Goran, 2005). Consequently, bureaucracy cannot be limited only to its task of execution but also to governance. Is good governance non-bureaucratic. Govt. should be intelligent, but as lean as feasible-strong but restricted. The problem is not big or small government, but good governance, where power is divided and dispersed where necessary and power is allocated where expertise determines (Berggruen & Gardels, 2014). Amartya Sen argues that growth should include a wide range of liberties or privileges, such as the fundamental ability to avoid poverty, undernourishment and early death, as well as educational privileges and the ability to engage in the political process” (Hygen and Goran, 2005).

Therefore, government refers to personal organization in various political regimes. There are three legs of governance: fiscal, political, and administrative (Hygen and Goran, 2005). The origins of governance also lie in various roles of multiple departments and parts of society in collaboration. Socialisation, the wise involvement of the public in the development of political society, the executive effect of government, the managerial part of bureaucracy, the legislative dimensions of financial firms and the settlement of disputes by the judiciary; the cohesive operation of the above domains is an essential part of good governance. The unorganized or inactive function of any one of the factors would definitely disrupt the other’s effectiveness. The Regulatory Machinery executes laws. Bureaucracy is a critical government body in which “Ministers make policy decisions and civil servants take the proper executive actions to execute them” (Hygen and Goran, 2005). One cannot ignore the crucial role of bureaucracies in the rise and fall of states. Bureaucratic governance venue has considered vital importance but even imbalanced accountability can encourage bureaucrats to perform unfairly. In different regimes, moreover, bureaucratic success in the form of governance of laws, politization, effective delivery method, public’s trust, economic growth, institutional power, income-seeking mentality, and bribery, etc. can be examined.

## **Governance in Pakistan: Historical Perspective and Nature in Various Regimes:**

### **Colonial Regime:**

In 1600 A.D., the British East India Company (B.E.I.C.) was the third trading body (after the Dutch and French) to discover India’s coastline with Queen Elizabeth-I’s approval to expand overseas trade practices for a fifteen-year term only. The government became an authoritarian monarchy. The British acquired an abnormal tradition of authority even by European standards, founding formal expression in state laws (Ilhan, 2010). British empire also provided for a standardized rule of law (Khan, 2012). Company employees have been branded “servants” Office of District Collector was established for revenue collection in 1769 but adopted a legitimate role as a consequence of the ‘Pitt’s Act’ in 1784. Here, servants ‘position from mercantile practices was converted into Revenue Administration civil servants. The Governor General’s Office was established with the posting of ‘Warren Hastings’ in 1773. Warren Hastings (1774-85) was credited to the basic framework of the public service, while Lord Cornwallis (1785-93) initiated the changes by implementing the ‘Secretariat System.’ Government of India Act-1858, expropriated avaricious rule of East India Company and passed the regulatory power to the British Crown. Also Viceroy became the Governor General. The Secretary of State’s Office for India was developed. That were directly controlled by the Emperor Civil Service. In British India there were more than 400 districts and one district officer in each (Philip, 1985).

Service was subsequently renamed “Indian Civil Service” (ICS) B.y 1934, India’s management structure was composed of seven All India Services and five Central Departments.

British rule had completed the political restructuring of the Subcontinent. This established a framework of federal, regional, and subordinate resources through progressive changes that created the executive branch of the unified country. The 1,000 to 1,000,500 Indian Civil Service (ICS) representatives were the legal equivalent of the five hundred senior-most ‘Mansabdars’ in the Timurid Empire (Ilhan, 2010). As per the Great Mughal, Phillip Mason Akber, attempted to give India the unity she had almost achieved once under Ashoka, and once under the Gupta dynasty; his was the third try and the fourth was to be the British (Philip, 1985).

In contrast to the administrative tradition of Mughal Empire, the governing system in British rule was not centered on obeisance to the king because officers were not even the governor general’s personal slaves. Three hundreds of years-and-a-half-period governs over a mass of land the size of Europe, British Civil Service was politically motivated, meant for British ambitions to govern the subcontinent. Colonial bureaucrats manoeuvred as ‘political advisors’ and ‘effective agents,’ basically a political role in its nature (Nazim et al., 1973). The rule of law was the administrative pivot, contrary to the dictator’s law. No conceptual or realistic difference was drawn between civil and military power (Nazim et al., 1973).

### **Post-Independence Regime:**

One of British rule’s enduring dynasties was in the field of civil administration (Khan, 1999). Colonial administration framework derived its origins from Weberian management model— ‘Domination or execution of power rather than duty service or performance’ (Rathod, 2006). On the other side, the main responsibilities of Pakistan’s governmental machinery were assumed to be spiritually citizen-centred, law-based, and politically neutral, in which decentralisation was required to be the hallmark for meeting the needs of the ordinary man at the gross root level. National-building and financial sustainability have been the challenging task for Pakistan’s public servants. Sadly, Pakistan’s bureaucracy was unable to recognize those expectations.

Upon freedom, “Pakistan retained the control of India’s British government but also its system of administration. Lay a great risk here” (Sayeed, 2010). Enhanced promotions were given to junior ICS officers (nearly 105) although none of them deserved posting as the federal secretary of a sovereign State. Infringing on the nuance of the scenario, Quaid-i-Azam has in frank words presided over the bureaucrats on various occasions. He recommended in an address to a meeting of Baluchistan Civil Officers on 14 February 1948:

“We met here today, without distinguishing ourselves from being big or small, as servants of the country to believe out alternative ways to advance the interests of the people and our nation. From the largest to the smallest, we are all State servants”. (Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah, Speeches and Statements, 1947-48., 1989)

Going to address the Chittagong Gazetted Officers on March 25, 1948, he warned:

“You are not of the dominant class; you are of the servants. Make people feel you are their servants and mates, uphold the highest level of honesty, dignity, equality

and fair play”. (Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah, Speeches and Statements, 1947-48., 1989).

He warned during another informal conversation with civil officers at the Peshawar Government House on 14 April 1948:

“Do your work, courageously and sincerely, as servants to the people and the government. Operation is the Government’s backbone. Governments are created, governments are destroyed, prime ministers are coming and going, ministers are coming and going, but you are holding on, and so there is a very big responsibility on your hands. You should have no hand in endorsing this political party or faction, this political leader or that political leader— this is not your business.” (Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah, Speeches and Statements, 1947-48., 1989).

After Quaid-i-Azam’s demise and Liaquat Ali Khan’s murder, the civil servants became engaged in a conflict with the evolving political party elite; CSP quickly troubled with a multitude of sectional and rooted interests (Gorvine, 1993). Representatives of ICS consented to suffix the letters (ICS-Pakistan) after their names, not without persuasion. We relied themselves on having the right to their pension in Sterling and their house leaves in England (Gorvine, 1993). The CSP was established under the leadership of the previous Indian Audit and Accounts Service (IA&AS) member Chaudhri Muhamad Ali, who gained power under another representative, Ghulam Muhamad, and then entered its zenith under the control of an Indian Political Service officer, Iskandar Mirza (Aminullah, 2012).

Bureaucratic establishment in 1954 promoted determination to join four Western provinces called West Pakistan. This was intended to establish balance between the Provinces of East Wing (Bengali) and West Pakistan (Aminullah, 2012). Ayub Khan, being leader of martial law, removed few old ICS officers to suppress the administrative actors ‘unrepressed positions. Timorously the CSP-class turned to subservience. At the lesser rank (Gorvin, 1965), most of 3,000 denials, mandatory retirements and reduced rank occurred. The expulsion reignited a sense of legitimate confidence among people over the administrative efficiency, nationalist zeal and great moral tenor of the revolutionary rule of President Ayub (Aminullah, 2012). CSPs stationed in East Pakistan ruled Bengali in a dismissive manner. The ‘public honor’ idea was plopped at the back burner.

Eventually, complaints intensified, and some people went so far as to say that West Pakistan officers’ conduct was the primary cause of discord between eastern and western Pakistan. Although this is an overstated view, it does contain an aspect of truth (Ali, 1967). No special provisions have been made for the appointment of East Pakistan federal level officers.

While ICS / CSP officers implemented ‘Quota System’ to increase the number of Bengalis (East Pakistan Representation), their true strength stayed below one-fourth of the overall despite the vast majority in East Pakistan. Let’s take a look at the political presence of the two wings of Pakistan’s civil service (Islam, 1990).

**Table 1 Inter-Wing Representation in Civil Service of Pakistan, 1948-58**

Year	No of Officers	East Pakistan		West Pakistan	
		No	% of Total	No	% of Total
1948	18	2	11.1	16	88.9
1949	20	9	45.0	11	55.0
1950	20	6	30.0	14	70.0
1951	11	4	36.4	7	63.6
1952	17	5	29.4	12	70.6
1953	13	3	23.1	10	77.9
1954	25	7	28.0	18	72.0
1955	17	5	29.4	12	70.6
1956	21	11	52.4	10	47.6
1957	20	7	35.0	13	65.0
1958	24	10	41.7	14	58.3

**Inter-wing Representation in Higher Ranks of Central Secretariat of Pakistan 1955-56:**

The rivalry between East and West Pakistan has shown itself in allocating personnel, allocating funds, and setting quotas at the Civil Service Academy (to the detriment of the concept of merit) (Gorvine, 1993). The elite in West Pakistan and the Bureaucracy intensified the divide between the two sides which eventually led to a disastrous result. Throughout their placement in East Pakistan, Punjab-based bureaucrats viewed Bengali with contempt, considering the pompous supremacy of being 'administrative steel frame' and predecessors of Roman Empire, Lord Macaulay and British Raj. Bengali officials have been biased against and embarrassed over the numerous prejudices of colour, caste or slim framework. Currently, the reasons for issuing notice of the Bengali language in Arabic manuscript (Safdar, 1989) are impossible to understand.

The Bengali leaders were of a different composition to the West Pakistani officials as the Bengalis were democratic in character, more cooperative in attitude, more relaxed, similar to the citizens in mood and disposition and less haughty (Braibanti, 1993). West Pakistan bureaucrats planted the seeds of hate among the public at large and civil servants related to East Pakistan with superconscious, pretentious and remote demeanour. This attitude highlighted sentiments of alliance between Pakistan's two sections.

Bureaucratic pogroms were created to capsize CSP class supremacy. The purges of 303 and 1303 saw General Yahya Khan and Zulfikar Ali Bhutto reject a number of ICS / CSP personnel in 1969 and 1972, respectively. This elimination of bureaucracy politicized the company as the danger of losing service stood over their heads. Bhutto's nationalisation policy has stressed the crucial role of Pakistan's weak, untrained, and corrupt elite. Bureaucracy stabilized itself during General Zia's military government (1977-88). Three close confidants in the Zia administration were Ghulam Ishaq Khan, Roedaad Khan (Interior Secretary) and Ijlal Haidar Zaidi (Defence Secretary). (Hussain, 1993) General Zia offered the civil servants higher confidence by ending the

testing activity. During the Zia regime, the military played a leading role in policymaking, whereas the bureaucracy was intended only to enforce the policies. In spite of its pogroms, moreover, administrators breathed a breath of relief.

Devolution plan-2001 was schemed in the Musharraf Administration to degenerate political, economic and administration control to the levels of district, tehsil and union councils (Musharraf, 2008). On 14 August 2001, the Deputy Commissioner's office was removed and replaced by District Coordination Officer. A freshly created position was implemented in the district as an administrative hub of the elected governor (District Nazim), while the District Coordination Officer and District Police Officer were held under his subjection. The World Bank has acknowledged the establishment of detailed rules for district-level governance as a quiet change in Pakistan (Musharraf, 2008). Bureaucrats originally took this scheme as just another step to reduce their governmental authority. Most DMG officials have chosen for high overseas research programs. Nevertheless, keeping in mind the serious financial powers of District Coordination Personnel (up to 50 million) as 'Principal Accounting Officer' and the charge of twelve district-level agencies, they hurried again during the main stream. General Musharraf said, "I had to resist considerable bureaucracy force and suspense attempting to nip this structure in the herb, but we carried our ground and managed to bring the new format in place" (Musharraf, 2008).

Rent-seeking behaviours, shoot-back and corrupt culture overflowed broadly through a channelled web of attractive posts for blue-eyed young officers in the upper echelons of bureaucracy. Pakistan Muslim League (N) awarded a white paper relating to stock market corruption cases, sugar scandals, oil and concrete cartels, Steal to land mafia, steal to land mafia redistribution, privatisation related to Musharraf regime (Corruption scandals of Musharraf regime put on the shelf, 2013). The Pakistan People's Party (PPP) stayed in power for five years (2008-2013), and manoeuvred for the very first time in Pakistan's political history to achieve total term. Punjab-the largest district, administered by the Pakistan Muslim League (N) while PPP controlled the centre and Sind. In addition to the 18th Amendment-2010 and the 7th National Finance Commission (NFC) Prize, the state also faced serious problems of governance and corruption allegations. Junior federal officers of 18 and 19 grades (DMG & ex-cadre) came to be known as de-facto Punjab leaders. In contrast with the subsidiarity principle, local authority polls were always intentionally avoided, disparaging the same as Musharraf's legacy. State-owned companies such as (PIA), Pakistan Steel Mill (PSM), Pakistan Railways have fallen prey to bureaucratic inefficiencies due mainly to self-serving practices. The management metrics were negatively affected by rental power fraud, NICL bribery case, and Swiss-bank and Ephedrine quota cases. During this period, the hallmark of federal and provincial governments in Pakistan was bureau-political collaboration and its abuse. On 21 May 2012, central DMG officials were able to improve their rank by transferring the terminology from the District Management Group (DMG) to the Pakistan Administrative Service (PAS). Officials of PAS began using their names with suffix PAS. This was a strategic move to distract the nation's focus that was well versed in DMG officers' corruption.

Bureaucracy was politized during the PML (N) government (as of 2013). Many Federal officers on duty in Punjab have been taken out to handle the federation's dealings. Both the federal and Punjab level govts came to be run by DMG / PAS federal agents. The main characteristics of the PML (N) rule were political appointment of junior officers at greater levels, nepotism, tax concession packages for favoured companies, company-friendly environment rather than market-friendly industry. Pakistan's president, Nawaz Sharif, was removed in Panama Paper Leaks as a

consequence of a decision by the Supreme Court. (Nawaz Sharif ousted as Pakistan's premier in corruption case, 2017)

In 2014, the deaths of about 200 innocent children from food (hunger) and health problems in Sind (Thar-Mithi) posed a testament to the inefficiency, management problem and unaccountability in Pakistan's governmental machinery (Khawar, 2017). The deteriorating law and order scenario and regular murders in Karachi (Sind) and Quetta (Baluchistan) posed major question marks on Pakistan's bureaucracy's abilities and institutional consistency. Punjab provincial officers have been strongly oppressed against as regards promotion, transfer and posting. Since March 18, 2011, they had not been promoted in accordance with their correct portion. Govt expanded the federal quota system for an additional 20 years (Cabinet extends jobs quota in govt service for 20 years, 2013). Extending the quota (Cabinet session: Federal job quota gets new lease of life, 2017) and discriminating against regional officers (Bakhsh, 2014) contravened the principle of provincial independence imposed by the Constitution.

### **Administrative Ramifications:**

### **Politicization of Bureaucracy:**

Bureaucracy seized power with dominant role after the killing of Liaquat Ali Khan. The other agencies were weakened by that fault line. The primacy of non-elected bodies over legislative bodies quit the week of Parliament and supported the executive (Lodhi, 2011). Political structures started to be seen as weaker than the bureaucratic steel frame (Racine, 2012). The upper bureaucracy was diverging from Quaid's sayings and taking a leading position over lawmakers. Dissolved Constituent Assembly. There was a coalition between the bureaucracy and the military during this time through the "four-gang" consisting of Ghulam Muhammad, Chaudhary Muhammad Ali, Iskandar Mirza, and General Ayyub Khan (Hussain, 1993). During the Ayyub rule (1958-68) provisions for the distribution of power were made between military and bureaucracy. The bureaucracy gained power by taking on a military sub-servant role. The ICS / CSP bureaucrats performed a biased and political role as commissioners, deputy commissioners, and assistant commissioners through the Basic Democracies (BD) Process. 1965 presidential election permitted the CSP to demonstrate its 'devotion' to the armed dictator (Chaudhary, 2012). They've raised a breath of relief from the Damocles Sword during General Zia's military rule, circled by Z A Bhutto. Bureaucrats celebrated the social unrest of the 1990s and the PPP period (2008-2013) in which different parties faced the problem of federal and provincial multi party govts. Clever officials were embodied in maneuvering policy imbalance, since the province's chief executive had no bureaucratic authority to arrest any federal agent.

Punjab observed this downturn where Dr. Tauqer Shah, then Principal Secretary to Chief Minister, was usually referred to as the Punjab's de-facto CM (Sarmad, 2017). In 2014, PML(N) named Habibullah Khan Khattak, Federal Secretary for Ports and Shipping, Arbab Muhammad Arif-Additional Chief Secretary of Fata and Fawad Hasan Fawad-Additional Secretary of the PM Office as a member of the 'Taliban Peace Committee' for dialog with activists (Wasim, 2017). Current phase of PML (N), 2013 onwards is the hegemony and recurrent rise of bureaucrats by bureaucratic politicization. The tenor of rising tide has also moved along with Punjab.

Civil servants have learned the art of being part of political regimes to enjoy the halls of power, being discretionary decision-making power, becoming de-facto leaders, channelized policy-making system for vested interest, colonial lifestyle, white collar abuse, and unrestricted

advantages and benefits. A philosophy of gaining unlimited resources by hook or by crook has taken root (Khan, 2011) in the shortest period of time. They have issues only to wish the ruling class, not the common man, for their financial stake gains. Now these little Max Weber cogs are no longer state servants but the true rulers of the oppressed public's fate.

**Gradual Institutional Decay:**

Pakistan has experienced only small franchise for the past two decades where political institutions were poorer than bureaucracy's steel frame (Racine, 2012). Consecutive politics regimes in Pakistan turned bureaucracy into a politized body to prevent firing, transition and posting imperils. Institutional power had been speared with game rules and regimes. Charles H. Kennedy disagreed with the quota system in the terms, "the quota chooses applicants who are not the 'best' eligible for selection according to whatever criteria of merit is implemented. Such a recruitment policy undoubtedly makes the workforce less efficient" (Kennedy, 1987). Educational standards in colleges and universities cannot produce possible candidates for review in the civil service. Current education system (proposals, strategies, services and programs) is nothing more than positive statements and sparkling optimism (Bengali, 1999). The Federal Public Service Commission hires just 7.5 percent for open-merit and 92.5 percent for quota-based recruitment, as in (Sayeed, 2010):

**Table 2 Percentage of Quota-Based and Open-Merit Recruitment**

Induction	Detail of Quota						Open- Merit
	Punjab	Sind	KPK	Baluchistan	Fata/ Gilgit- Baltistan	AJK	
Percentage	50	19	11.5	06	04	02	7.5

It has been noted that the best deals of the new failing education system usually do not sit for review in the civil service (Hussain, 1993). Federal and provincial civil servants are educated through the Department of Civil Service Training, Administration and Professional Development (MPDD) and the National School of Public Policy, and the PASC. Education parallels are conveyed mostly via guest speakers (seminars), immersive sessions that are void of busy work tasks. The programs are so shallow and the assessment of the students soft that the present generation of officials with a rather moderate intellectual (Hussain, 1993). has no great intellectual obstacle. Denials, promotions, and positions often put at risk the intellectual ability of managerial machinery. The nexus of politico-bureaucrats led to arbitrary decision-making. The more deterioration accelerated systemic collapse. Roedaad Khan, a former member of the higher bureaucracy, asks: "It's shocking that the reputation of service is tainted and that public trust in its honesty, impartiality and capacity to deliver is fully broken" (Khan, 2011) Machinery that is morally and intellectually impaired is unable to address the problems of crushing poverty and social division, race and factionalism, collapse of law and order and economic expansion.

**Estrangement between Federal and Provincial Services:**

Since Pakistan's birth, estrangement was pre-eminent. In 1950 the Pakistani govt passed a resolution retaining the CSP as an all-Pakistan service (Chaudhary, 2012). West Pakistan Officers were initially reluctant to be posted by East Pakistan. The officers of the Provincial Civil Service



expressed resentment at the digital “provincial zest.” It was also asserted that if the CSP and PCS officers ‘ duties and responsibilities were nearly identical, why would the CSP officers be promoted much quicker than their PCS counterparts (Chaudhary, 2012).. As a consequence of CSP (composition & cadre) Rules-1954, 25 percent of the positions were confined for officers of the Provincial Civil Service (PCS) (Civil Service of Pakistan (Composition & Cadre) Rules, 1954, 1954). But this has modified because the All Pakistan Unified Grades (APUG) implemented in 1973 did not give PCS any advantage Civil Service of Pakistan (CSP) was eliminated after the enactment of the Constitution-1973 and a new service division, District Management Group (DMG) was created. DMG weren’t CSP’s replacement. CSP generally consisted of two programs when DMG was just one.

<b>PROVINCE</b>	<b>BPS-17</b>	<b>BPS-18</b>	<b>BPS-19</b>	<b>BPS-20</b>	<b>BPS-21</b>	<b>BPS-22</b>
PUNJAB	25%	40%	50%	60%	65%	100%
SIND	25%	40%	50%	60%	65%	100%
NWFP	25%	40%	50%	60%	65%	100%
BALUCHISTAN	25%	40%	50%	60%	65%	100%

On September 19, 1993, in the Inter Provincial Cooperation Committee (IPCC) Formula (Minutes of the meeting, Case No. 47/CS/93-1 dated 19-09-1993, 1993), DMG set the largest share for themselves and denied PCS officers. In Punjab the DMG officers discriminated against PCS. PCS Officer promotion from BS-17 to BS-18 have been extended for nearly 20 years whereas DMG Officers have been promoted within 4-5 years. Junior DMG officers were appointed to high posts in one or two phases. Under Junior DMG Officers senior PCS officers were coerced into serving. DMG grabbed all the key positions of Chief Secretary, Additional Chief Secretary, Senior Member Revenue Board, Chairman (P&D), Heads of attached agencies, autonomous bodies, and nearly all programs. In 2010, the provincial services of four provinces questioned the deployment of DMG officers in the provinces by way of seven Constitutional Writ Petitions, i.e. 53/2010,54/2010,55/2010,56/2010 and others in the Supreme Court of Pakistan. On 18<sup>th</sup> March 2011 (Cheema, 2011), 73 PCS officials were detained on peaceful protest for rights in the Punjab Civil Secretariat. Provincial officials were harshly reprimanded and biased against. A Statutory Regulatory Order (SRO) in 2014 created new proceedings among even federal service groups (Secretariat Group and DMG). Officers of PCS and PMS were disdained as subordinates to the civil service. Harassed by the governing bureaucratic upper class, provincial officers were made to take on a subordinate role under the Federal Officers (DMGs).

This discord among federal and provincial officers further overshadowed hopes for effective governance. DMG’s (now PAS) discriminatory practices, poor advancement opportunities for PCS officials and the absence of All Pakistan Service (APS), as set out in Article 240 of the 1973 Constitution of Pakistan, contributed to institutional degradation and further exacerbated the already existing gulf between provincial and federal officials.

### **Culture of Unaccountability:**

Interest universality between some of the politicians and bureaucrats has culminated in a system of corruption. In addition, lack of understanding, expertise combined with blinkered political vision overrun bureaucrats with important role in policy making. The National Accountability Bureau (NAB) and the Anti-Corruption Establishment (ACE) were directly or indirectly operated by the same clique of bureaucrats. ACE has never filed a corruption case against any federal service department Minister, Commissioner or DCO as opposed to the provincial service officers. The ideology of the Commission has permeated so widely in the works of growth that it is not now known as an evil custom. Channelized process of transparency undermined the abuse.

### **Policy Recommendations:**

Bureaucracy is the foundation of any govt that turns comments and suggestions into fact, and public good behavior. Following policy guidelines, the governance criteria can be improved:

Theory of 21st Century intelligent govt is anti-bureaucratic. Under the doctrine of subsidiary, decentralization, and local government system development with independent economic, political, and legislative authority, civil society involvement toward better management can be enhanced. A quite federalism may smash the bureaucrats ' dominance, and this public alienation. It will strengthen national unity where the ordinary man would feel blessed and inspired.

Ascendance of one party over the other during in-service practice shall be washed out. educational institutions, intended for mid-career leadership and high figures, must prioritize growth through research methods supervised by highly qualified research scholars rather than bureaucrats (meaning only for policy making). With technologically advanced methods of management, the global community can help to strengthen the prevailing framework of the civil service. Unreconstructed bureaucracy, devolve and unqualified, can never enhance governance.

Bureaucracy policymaking must be deserted by means of new laws and strict regulations to maintain the bureaucracy impartial, unbiased and neutral. Stern action against the politically aligned bureaucrats needs to be launched. This isolation would boost red tape.

Independent Judicial Commission to negotiate inter-service, inter-provincial and federal-provincial disputes concerning provincial shares, provincial posting of federal agents, promotions, transfers and posting. This committee may be set up without any working or retiring bureaucrat joining it. The Commission may also revoke the breach of Article 240 of the Constitution and proviso of Article 27 of Eighteenth Amendment.

Modernization and purification of civil service by testing and correct-sizing. If DMG clique can't change its behavior yet still think of themselves as steel government frame with this mismanagement, then transformation and purging must become essential and operational.

The Provincial Civil Services (PCS) of each Province are fairly able to manage affairs of state in the Provinces and Federal Service Groups (Railways, Banks, International Department, Taxes, Away from the coast Survey, Postal Services, State council Group etc.) are ready to handle the Federation and Federating Units. Their specific role needs to be strengthened by

comprehensive local and international practice, higher studies, research methodologies and annual training services.

Hydra-headed greed creatures must contend with iron hand diplomacy. It is important to screen out officials living beyond their means, or engaging in misconduct. Channelized corruption can be regulated by the essential position of the intelligence agencies. Anti-Corruption Organization and NAB have lost their effectiveness in these organizations because of a politically biased posting of bureaucrats. Renovation of the comment system by high character officers will recover process of accountability.

Commissions of the Federal and Provincial Public Service shall be open, autonomous and impartial; It mainly consists of retired bureaucrats that have already served in the same bureaucratic system. This can encourage favoritism for their colleagues, reducing legitimate prospects of talented applicants being picked. Such practice needs to be put to an end in order to restore public trust, fairness and integrity in the hiring process so that the benefits of equality, fairness and fair play can be enjoyed by the ordinary man.

### **Conclusions:**

It is assumed that the bureaucracy organization has lost the abilities, productivity, and expertise that they received from the colonial history. Current bunch of bureaucrats are unable to understand the nature of considerable issues of poverty, social division, racism and religious extremism, deterioration of law and order, and financial stagnation due to a lack of study, combined with shallow learning environment. Declining intellectual ability has detracted from the opportunities of parameters of leadership. Multiple educational institutions (National School of Public Policy and others) intended for training and career development have failed miserably to achieve the goal of competent and scientifically excellently-equipped officials to effectively run the government's affairs. Paradox of nature is that the same clique of officials runs the educational institutes in the state too. How can a constrained mind spread healthy and nutritious thoughts in a grim and sentimental atmosphere?

Bureaucracy policymaking incapacitated this body in various ways. Politicization, bureau-political joviality, bureaucratic regression, arbitrary decision-making, corruption allegations, send-back culture, white-collar crime, and unaccountability culminated in the supremacy of PAS officers during the present govt. Packetized bribery exacerbated the situation still further. On the federal and provincial levels, the bureau-political system provided bureaucrats with a preeminent and definitive role in policy making. The lack of proper oversight made them answerable. Public policies continue to be designed for the needs of the wealthy at the detriment of the executive and celestial public authorities Yet high domestic and international debt.

### **Bibliography and References**

Hyden, Goran, et. al. In Making Sense of Governance (USA: Lynne Rienner Publisher, Inc., 2005): 12-28.

Nicolas Berggruen and Nathan Gardels. Intelligent governance for the 21st century: a middle way between West and East (Cambridge: Polity, 2014): 107.

Hyden, Goran, et. al. op. cit. 12-28.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Niaz Ilhan. The culture of power and governance of Pakistan, 1947-2008 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010).

Hamid Khan. Principles of administrative law: a comparative study (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2012).

Mason Philip. The Men Who Ruled India (London.: The Trinity Press, 1985).

Niaz Ilhan. op. cit.

Mason Philip. op. cit.

Nazim, Babus. Brahmans and bureaucrats: a critique of the administrative system in Pakistan (Lahore: Peoples Publ. House, 1973): 2-21.

Ibid. (Nazim et al., 1973)

Mohammad Mohabbat Khan. "Civil service reforms in British India and united Pakistan," International Journal of Public Administration 22, no. 6 (1999).

P. B. Rathod. The galaxy of administrative thinkers (Jaipur, India: ABD Publishers, 2006):43-56.

Khalid B. Sayeed. Pakistan: the formative phase, 1857-1948 (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2010): 258-268.

Govt. of Pakistan. "Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah, Speeches and Statements, 1947-48." Directorate of Films & Publications, Ministry of Information & Broadcasting, (1989).p.143

Ibid

Albert Gorvine. "The Civil Service Under the Revolutionary Government in ' Pakistan," Middle East Journal, (1965). Gohar Altaf. Ayoub Khan: Pakistan's First Military Ruler (Lahore: Combine Printers, 1993).

Ibid

Chaudry Aminullah. Political Administrators-The story of Civil Service of Pakistan (Karachi: Oxford University Press. 2012).

Ibid.

Albert Gorvine. "The Civil Service Under the Revolutionary Government in Pakistan," Middle East Journal, (1965).

Chaudry Aminullah. op. cit.

Chaudhry Muhammad Ali, *The Emergence of Pakistan* (Lahore: Reserch Society of Pakistan, 1967): 363.

Muhammad Nazrul Islam, *Pakistan a Case Study in National Integration* (Lahore, Karachi, Islamabad, Peshawar: Vanguard Books Pvt Ltd, 1990).

Albert Gorvine. op. cit.

Mahmood Dr Safdar., *Pakistan Divided: study of factors and forces, leading to the breakup of Pakistan in 1971* (Lahore: Premier Printers, 1989).

R. Braibanti, *Research on the bureaucracy of Pakistan* (Duke University Press, 1966).

Mushahid Hussain and Akmal Hussain. "Pakistan-Problem of Governance" Centre for Policy Research, New Delhi (1993): 1-24

Pervez Musharraf, *In the line of fire: a memoir* (London: Pocket Books, 2008).

Ibid.

Ibid.

The News, "Corruption scandals of Musharraf regime put on the shelf ," The News, August 13, 2013, , accessed September 18, 2017, <https://www.thenews.com.pk/archive/print/632431-corruption-scandals-of-musharraf-regime-put-on-the-shelf.%202013>.

Financial Times, "Nawaz Sharif ousted as Pakistan's premier in corruption case," The Financial Times, July 28, 2017,, accessed September 18, 2017, <https://www.ft.com/content/b5b046de-7368-11e7-aca6-c6bd07df1a3c>

Shahzad, Ahmad Khawar. "Tharparkar Fiasco in Pakistan: A Crisis of Governance and its Future Implications." ISSRA PAPERS: A Journal of Governance and Public Policy IX, No. I (2017): 77-98.

AFP, "Cabinet extends jobs quota in govt. service for 20 years," Geo News, July 25, 2013, accessed September 18, 2017, <https://www.geo.tv/latest/88279-cabinet-extends-jobs-quota-in-govt-service-for-20-years>.

The Express Tribune, "Cabinet session: Federal job quota gets new lease of life," The Express Tribune, July 26, 2013, accessed September 18, 2017, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/582145/cabinet-session-federal-job-quota-gets-new-lease-of-life/>.

Tariq, Mian Allah Bakhsh. The Frontier Post. Accessed March 14, 2014.

Maleeha Lodhi, *Pakistan, Beyond the Crisis State* (United Kingdom: Hurst & Co (private) Ltd. 2011): 45-78.

Jean Luc Racine. "Pakistan's Predicaments: The Diagnostic and the Debates within." *Journal of Pakistan Vision*, 1-31. 2012.. "Pakistan's Predicaments: The Diagnostic and the Debates within." *Journal of Pakistan Vision* 13, no.1 (2012): 1-31.

Mushahid Hussain and Akmal Hussain. "Pakistan-Problem of Governance" Centre for Policy Research, New Delhi 1, (1993): 1-24

Aminullah Chaudhary. op. cit.

Ali, Sarmad. "Dr Tauqeer Shah to "play up facts" to save Shahbaz, bureaucracy happy to rid of de-facto CM. "Pak Destiny. June 26, 2014. Accessed September 06, 2017. <https://www.pakdestiny.com/dr-tauqeer-shah-to-play-up-facts-to-save-shahbaz-bureaucracy-happy-to-rid-of-de-facto-cm/#>.

Amir Wasim. "Bureaucrats to pursue dialogue with Taliban," *DAWN*, March 13, 2014, accessed September 26, 2017, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1092868>.

Roedad Khan. *Pakistan, a dream gone sour* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2011), 182- 188.

Jean Luc Racine. "Pakistan's Predicaments: The Diagnostic and the Debates within." *Journal of Pakistan Vision*, 1-31. 2012.. "Pakistan's Predicaments: The Diagnostic and the Debates within." *Journal of Pakistan Vision* 13, no.1 (2012): 1-31.

Charles H. Kennedy, *Bureaucracy in Pakistan* (Karachi: Oxford Univ. Press, 1987): 181- 208.

Kaiser Bengali. *History of educational policy making and planning in Pakistan* (Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute, 1999).

Khalid B. Sayeed. op. cit.

Mushahid Hussain and Akmal Hussain. "Pakistan-Problem of Governance" Centre For Policy Research, New Delhi 1, (1993): 1-24

Ibid

Roedad Khan. *Pakistan, a dream gone sour* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2011): 186.

Aminullah Chaudhary. *Political Administrators-The story of Civil Service of (Karachi-Pakistan: Oxford University Press. 2012): 26-58.*

Ibid

Cab. Sectt. Notification. "Civil Service of Pakistan (Composition & Cadre) Rules, 1954." In No. F. 25/12/51-SEI dated: Karachi, the 1<sup>st</sup> June, 1954, by Establishment Officer E. A. FRANKLIN. Karachi: Cabinet Secretariat (Establishment Division): 1954.

Minutes of the meeting, Case No. 47/CS/93-1 dated 19-09-1993, issued vide No. 47/CS/93 Dated: Islamabad, the 22nd September, 1993 by the Cabinet Secretariat (Cabinet Division), Islamabad.

Chaudhary Ahmar Cheema. The Nation, March 19, 2011, 2, accessed June 5, 2017,  
<http://nation.com.pk/E-Paper/lahore/2011-03-19/p.2>.