## Digital Displays and Retail Sales: Emergent Role of Digital Advertising in Pakistan

by

# **Mubashir Qureshi**

Fellow of PhD Management Sciences, Shaheed Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto Institute of Science and Technology (SZABIST) Karachi, Pakistan Email: mubashar q@yahoo.com

#### **Abdul Samad Shaikh**

Lecturer, Benazir School of Business, Benazir Bhutto Shaheed University, Lyari Karachi, Pakistan

Email: abdsamadshaikh@gmail.com

#### Juned Ali Shah

Lecturer Marketing, Shaheed Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto Institute of Science and Technology(SZABIST) Larkana, Pakistan Email: junaid.shah88@gmail.com

#### **Abstract**

The research investigates the relationship and impact of Marketing and Advertising through Digital Displays in Shopping Malls their impact on Sales. Various researches elaborate the Digital Displays as marketing tool although unable to analyze connection with Sales of an organization and Brands at Shopping Malls. The Quantitative research conducted based on theoretical framework of Impulse Buying Behavior affects the consumer buying decision while doing shopping in big Shopping Malls. The research data collected through Self-Administered Survey form with fixed responses over Likert scale. The Data collected through Probability Simple Random Sampling with Criterion of 95% Confidence Internal from the Consumers who visits big Shopping Malls in Karachi Pakistan includes the Ocean Mall, Hyper Star, Lucky one and Atrium Mall are considered as big Shopping Malls where Digital Screen are Placed. The Research results Procced through SPSS Software and researcher performs the Internal reliability test to test the reliability of data and Correlation and regression Analysis performed to evaluate the relationship and impact of Digital Display Location, Content, Size and Size of Shopping malls and Environment of Shopping Malls on Sales. The Correlation Analysis there is Significant Positive relationship of Digital Displays on Sales of organization and Regression Analysis confirms the hypothesis of significant impact. The Research will be useful for marketers to evaluate the changing trends and effective utilization of Digital Displays in Shopping Malls.

**Keywords:** Digital Displays, Retail Sales, Size of Shopping malls, Location of Shopping Malls, Digital Displays Content, Relationship and impact of Digital Display on Consumers.

### **Introduction:**

### **Background of Research:**

The Sales in organizations has influenced many factors. one of the prominent factor is advertising. The role of advertising is changing due to the changing dynamics of social media and digital age. The digital media provides a lot of benefits to retailers and it can increase the customer's attention for purchase of product. The Digital screens in selection of shopping malls increase the retail sales and enhance the customer attraction. The research is focused upon influenced of digital display that increase the attention of consumer in shopping malls and placements of these screens affect the sales of retail sector. The research is focused on big shopping malls in Pakistan to evaluate the customer behavior and effect of digital displays on purchasing decisions of customers (Roggeveen, Nordfält, and Grewal 2016).

The advertising through Digital displays is increasing and today's evidence is that consumer's behavior can be changed with digital and online technology. Now a days the budget of on-air advertisements are being shifted to digital side. Brands like Carrefour, Ebco, Imtiaz, Khaadi, Sana Safinaz and Nestle are paying a lot on digital displays rather TVCs. The updated consumer survey has been conducted in Pakistan and the report reveals that the Pakistan is sizzling market for advertising and it gives better power of engagement rather than just a brand perception, it creates connectivity between the shopper and brand. The branding, promotions and digital displays can affect their decision making during buying process through digital advertisements (Tayyab, Tariq and Narula, 2017).

The Digital Screens provide information to customers towards the different brands and it helps in increasing the sales at shopping malls, not directly benefitting the shopping malls but, also it increases the sales of stores. The increase in competition and online marketing the Digital displays is one of the important aspects to enhance the sales of organizations by increasing customer focus and attraction. (Roster, 2012)

Digital advertising is growing at a high pace, with the global market expected to be worth over \$17 billion by 2017 (Intel, 2014). The continuous growth of marketing competition of the digital signage provides an effective way to increase promotion by enhancing the customer in store environment where customer is at the shopping malls for purchasing the goods and services. The information of different discounts, new arrivals such as summer arrivals, winter arrivals and different promotion in stores (Kumar, Anand, and Song 2017).

Various studies suggest that digital displays have the potential to enhance shopping behavior. In one of the studies it has found that digital signs enhance customer attraction in large super markets where different brands are available and in store branding attraction is also important with marketing promotion through digital displays (Vrontis et al, 2016)

The purchases of services and goods are at the core of retailing. By giving the valuable offers and great customer experience is the foundation for a brand to make superiority amongst other brands. The holistic concept of customer's experience includes the costumer's perception, social and physical reactions to the retailer. This experience is made not just by these components which the retailer can control such as cost, environment, variety, and external control of retailer (Grewal, Levy, and Kumar and Verhoef et al, 2009). The Consumers spare time in stores and

search for good products and services, digital display is the main source of information and appealing to them, as they spend more time and visit various stores the attraction increases and it causes change in consumer behavior and sales (Kallweit, Spreer, and Toporowski, 2014).

The research also reveals that the super markets and shopping centers where digital displays enhance the attraction of consumers, this can increase the information regarding brand and promotion, where customer can visit and shop freely without planned list. The important implication of digital display only attracts those customers which are impulsive buyers and they don't want to spend time or make more visits in shopping malls and focus on good quality and this will lead to increase in sales. In case of smalls super stores, supercenters and food courts digital displays might distract customer behavior where customer arrives with fixed list and digital displays district their attraction and this cause reduction in sales. The research is focused on big supermarkets and shopping malls where customers have more time to think about brands and products, digital displays can change their behavior of choosing the brand through advertisements and this cause increase in sales at the stores.

This research investigates the impact of digital signage on retail sales, and focused upon the hypermarkets and shopping malls where customer feel free to shop and have more time for buying. Past research shows that retail formats influence consumer's in-store shopping behavior and proclivity for impulse purchases (Stilley, Inman, and Wakefield 2010 and Grewal et al. 2017), with an empirical orientation that digital displays enhance the sales and data will be collected through survey forms and this will also increase their information that why these digital displays are placed in the markets and how customer sees these digital displays. The research implication will be helpful for shopping malls and marketers of different brand to analyze this promotional technique.

### **Research Problem:**

This research investigates the impact of digital signage on retail sales, as well as whether the impact of the digital signage varies by the retail format. Past research shows that consumers were only focusing on in-store shopping without having awareness of brand and were least interested in digitalization. The changing age of digital media significantly affects the consumer's attraction and digital screen in shopping malls is the source of attraction to customers in retail shopping malls and it changes the consumer buying pattern. This research is focused on the changing perception, brand awareness and shopping patterns through digital displays and what are the impact promotional activities by companies in big shopping malls. This research helps to explicate the role of digital displays in enhancing retailers in-store marketing efforts. In-store digital displays are being widely considered, but investing in them is not an insignificant decision. The research elaborates the Digital Displays as new sources of advertising and research will add knowledge to literature by describing the usefulness of Digital Displays that was not available few years before.

### **Research Objectives:**

The research is focused on evaluating the importance of Digital signage in retail market and its impact on consumer buying decisions. The research objectives are;

1. To identify the relationship of Digital Displays with Consumer shopping patterns in stores for purchasing behavior.

- 2. To evaluate the impact of Digital Displays, Consumer Buying Decisions of retail in shopping malls.
- 3. To Analyze the impact of Digital Display's Effectiveness on Sales in Shopping Malls.

# **Research Questions:**

The research objectives are;

- 1. What is the influence of digital displays on shopping behaviors in Shopping Malls?
- 2. What is the relationship and impact of Digital Displays on Sales on Brands in Large Shopping Malls in Pakistan?

### **Scope of Study:**

Given the potential costs and benefits of digital signage, it is important to determine their actual effectiveness of advertising and digital displays on consumer buying decisions. The research is focused on retail Sector in Karachi-Pakistan and data will be collected from large hyper markets and large retails stores. This study reflects that Retailers must understand exactly how the displays will affect their bottom lines before they can make informed decisions about whether to invest in digital display technology for their stores. Researcher will accordingly have focused on whether digital displays influence shopping behaviors, how they depend on retail formats, and the impact of the displayed content. The research is focused on theory of impulsive buying behavior, explains the changing in consumer behavior based on impulse buying and Digital Displays enhance impulse buying behavior in Shopping Malls.

### **Limitations of Research:**

The research is based on marketing perspective of retail stores and focused on digital display in store front to attract customer and enhance sales. To analyze the impact of store front digital display researcher will evaluate the changes in buying patterns and changing behavior during the time of decision in purchase of a product that will help to analyze impact on sales. The Geographic limitation of research is the Area, this research is conducted in Karachi Pakistan and data collected from large Shopping Malls in Karachi. The research is limited to theory of impulse buying Behavior and Consumer Behavior Model of Purchase Decisions.

### **Literature Review:**

### **Conceptualization of Digital Displays:**

The big super stores provide one stop shopping to consumers and target large number of household's customers. Retail layout influences the consumer purchase decisions and customers are inclined towards impulse purchases. As such interactive experiences continue to take place, retailers capture customer loyalty and brand recognition (Bhattacharya and Sen, 2003). Increase in Customer engagement may eventually increase brand perception and brand awareness in the consumer mind and due to that brand loyalty increase and that customer develop a strong, committed and meaningful relationship with that brand or certain companies, and all those efforts create mass users of that brand. Impacts of Digital Displays significantly increasing in super stores and shopping malls based on atmosphere and audio, video content and location (Newman, Charles and Zaman, 2006). Digital Displays are the most important part of advertising nowadays in big

Super Stores like Walmart, Tesco and Carrefour installed digital displays that attract the consumers for buying goods and to change the consumer behavior while they decide to purchase of different commodities (Burke, 2009). Interactive customer experiences set retailers apart in customer's mind and such experiences are highly favorable to retailers bottom line, it keeps both (customer and the retailers) engaged with each other in long run (Grewal, Levy, and Kumar, 2009). The phenomena of two way communication between retailer and consumer leave a satisfaction in consumer mind it creates the brand loyalty, brand equity and higher perceived value, Hence, these positive experiences create a harmonious relation of customer with retailer's core values and mission and it serve to build up a base dimension of commitment and relationship with customers the main purpose of every brand is to give unforgettable remembrance to their customers because the unforgettable experience is also consistent.

Researchers reveal that the layout of stores and the size of stores have influence the shopping behaviors (Grewal et al, 2011). The Retail sector has faced huge competition in B2C market from online stores like Amazon and other E-ecommerce providers the Digital Display has become key focus in retail sector especially in B2C market (Roster, 2012).

In big Stores consumer has a list in mind and their buying behavior may change due to intensive digital displays in all corners of Supermarkets. Digital Displays has a positive impact on consumer buying approach in big supermarkets (Dennis et al, 2012). The Literature focuses on empirical researches and theoretical context of Consumer Buying Behavior, Impulse shopping patterns and consumer buying approach in large supermarkets.

## Digital Displays as a Tool for Marketing:

The big super markets where customers spend their time and have complete knowledge of products and brands thus it leads to better decision making while selecting the Brands and Digital displays attract those customers who does not have complete list in their minds. As Consequence for small stores and shopping centers where customers have complete list and during shopping these digital screens can distract those customers who have decide the shopping list already their minds (Ganesh, Reynolds, and Luckett 2007). The marketing dynamics are changing over the period and marketing practices become more advanced due to innovation of technology. The Consumers visit the retail stores to buy the products and brands of their choices and spend time on Quality Products, but due to lack of information regarding new arrivals, discounts, and prices they face difficulty in buying and decision making. The Digital Displays enhance the store environment and increase attraction of customers by increasing information and providing details of current promotion this creates impact on consumer's decisions and sales (Burke, 2009).

The various researches conducted to evaluate the retail layouts and store size which are credible factors, to influence the behavior of consumers (Grewal and et al, 2011). The Digital Screens Content is important for consumers, Contents including the information for New Brand and Designs (Roster, 2012).

The usage of Digital Displays motivates customers, build loyalty, and enhance their shopping experience and increase sales of brands (Roster, 2012). The Digital Signage provides the relevant information to customer near point of purchase and if motivation increases, they make decision to buy the product and get aware of trends, prices and availability. These Digital Screens support the consumers, as well as promote the brands in Shopping Malls and it is easier for brand to reach loyal customers (Dennis et al, 2014).

The shopping malls have become modernize and advanced nowadays. Whereas innovation and creativity has changed the world. So, previously shopping malls were made for the source of

serve basic need and all shops were available at one spot which satisfy customers by convenience. Now, it is changed and traditional shopping malls have been fully advanced where customers have also increased their footsteps because trendy and modern products are easily available. Consumers are mainly focused on convenience factor as where happy surroundings, social gathering, innovation and creativity made them to stay with this atmosphere. So, shopping malls are getting more advanced by gaining their sales and high profit margin but alternatively as businesses are growing and chances for the economic growth is also increasing and it is helpful for the economic benefit for country.

### Sales and the Role of Digital Displays:

The Digital displays are very attractive resource for brands and organizations today and considered as core part of environment of shopping malls. Various researches on Shopping malls describes that the customers are open to experience for shopping and very few customers have complete information regarding availability and new arrivals (Bell, Daniel and George, 2011). Consumers usually visit the big Shopping Malls with the decided list of purchase of various products and Services. The Digital Displays are important in retailing and Consumers get the advantage to have experience of various New Arrivals, Designs, Styles, and Discounts however in store advertisements can enhance their shopping experience and their decisions can be changed. The Consumer Buying Behavior has changed on the bases of impulsive buying, and that impact on sales (Nordfalt, 2009).

Another conducted study explains that the Digital Displays cannot affect the sales of customer with planned behavior. The size of store is also a credible factor although the consumer with open to shopping and experience and spend time in stores can easily attract from the digital sales (Nordfalt, 2009). Bell, Corsten, and Knox (2011), the study conducted in US describes the Digital Screens enhance the customer experience in Hyper markets like TESCO and Carrefour where customers are happy to know about brands, to have knowledge of products therefore sales of various brands increases in these shopping malls.

Bell, Corsten, and Knox (2011), The Digital Screens is innovative way to promote the Brands and enhance shopping malls and sales experience. Today, consumers are educated and less concern for continuous move to stores and search for products and they get relevant information through advisements with digital screens. The Digital Display Content, Advertainments on Digital Screen, Store format is also considerable factors in store format and enhance the sales experiences and become significant factors to change the behavior of customers and increase in sales.

The big chain stores like Walmart, Tesco and Carrefour installed digital displays to attract the consumers for buying goods and to change the consumer behavior while they decide to purchase of different goods (Burke, 2009).

The Digital Displays have become a major marketing tool for advertising to enhance the consumer experience and increase their motivation to buy. The market is growing day after day and has made an impressive growth in economy though the marketing and advertising pattern has changed now; the changing trends and practices enhance the customer experience and build loyal customers, brand equity and increase the sales (Stilley, Jeffrey and Kirk, 2010). The Digital Displays Content focuses on changing of trends, updated information, increase in sales of brand. Shopping Malls are also increasing day by day because the customer preferences are getting changed on every other day, as far as huge demand has increased of brands therefore the shopping malls are also working on their strategies to have more clients and marketers are applying multiple marketing strategies to make an effective selling. They are trying to provide customer needs as

well as working on strategies to gain attention of the customers. They are working on different attributes to create values for the shopping malls like convenience, Mall environment, Ambiance, Presence and main thing is quality services (Solomon, Bamossy & Hogg, 2006).

## **Digital Display Content and Promotional Strategy for Marketing:**

The Digital Display Content is important for customers as media buying agencies fix the Screens and Customers get attracted to see at screen for product information and availability. The Digital screens must have fulfilled information related to product, new arrivals, sales off and discounts so that customer may attract, visit the stores and looking forward to purchase it would increase the sales of brands. The Screens show the information regarding promotional material such as offers, discounts, new arrivals, products and services that crease more attraction of consumers (Solomon, Bamossy & Hogg, 2006).

Displays have become interesting and it motivates customers to buy the product and behavior might changes according to the content. If we are looking towards the attributes, these are driven by the need of the consumers and shopping malls are playing significant role to cater the particular need, also making the perception in the mind of the customer. Many of the customers are visiting shopping mall just for the sake of entertainment and to hang out with their families. In the Indonesia, most of the families are going towards the shopping mall not for the purpose of shopping but just to have a social gathering and interaction because they belong to collectivist culture. In this way, where customer feel happy to spent more time in the mall, it means they are fully satisfied with the quality services which are being provided to them and it is also clear that the need and expectations are also fulfilled (Nordfalt, 2006). The main objective of the shopping mall is to convert wants into needs whereas customer become more effectively and efficiently visits the shopping malls. Customers prefer their convenient places for purchasing of goods and where the need is to be satisfied and they become regular customer in the particular mall (Nordfalt, 2006). Hence, it is proved that convenience factor is one of the influential factors in terms of consumer satisfaction (Dennis et al., Kim et al., 2005).

The Digital Displays are important for retailers and in big Markets and Stores it has been more important for customers. The Digital Displays have been used as Promotional activity for customers to provide them information regarding the discounts, offers, activities and so forth. The Consumers with planned behavior may get less attractive towards the digital displays though consumers with unplanned behavior get motivated to buy available brand and offers that they are aware of. The digital displays in hypermarkets (which carry more categories) enhance customer's footsteps, spending more time in store, and it increases number of purchases. However, such effects don't occur in the smaller supermarkets, which mostly sell food items and household products (Stilley, Inman, and Wakefield 2010).

# Factors Considered in Digital Displays and impact on Sales:

There are various factors that affect the consumer buying behavior, and influence consumer behavior to shop in big shopping malls. The Consumers are looking forward for better product with good quality as some consumers are brand conscious, they also see availability of the brand as if the product is easily available everywhere. The Digital Displays as screens have placed at various shopping Malls, to attract customers and provide them information and engage customer to spend their time in shopping malls hence the sales of bands increase. The Digital Displays marketing and advertising the Place, Size and Content these are very important factors

to attract the customers. The research also focus upon three important dimensions includes the Place of Digital Display, Size and Content with two characteristics of shopping mall includes Environment of Shopping Mall and Size of Shopping malls, these dimensions are elaborated in literature.

# **Digital Display Location:**

The Digital Displays location is very important to keep customer focused and involved in advertising. The Customers are looking for these in big Shopping Malls and outside stores and Food Courts to have information and for the selection of the products. The digital displays has impact in greater sales receipts, consumers purchases more items, and spend more time in the hypermarkets, but they have minimal impacts in superstores. The Digital Displays are installed and implemented in big shopping malls and there is no huge impact of displays in superstores, therefore small stores are less important and decrease customer focus.

In Pakistan, there are lots of shopping malls have been inaugurated due to increase customer level like Atrium Mall in which many shops are there, even food chains with children play area and cinema for the entertainment. Such activities attract consumer to visit regularly and also engage them in entertainment activities.

According to the analysis, there are some other sub-attributes also like elevators and escalators and floor plans which are basically internal attributes of the shopping malls especially for those customers who want to buy everything easily without having difficulty while visiting to shopping mall. Digital display positively impacts shoppers approach behaviors (e.g., spending). This impact is mediated by perceptions of the retail environment and positive affect. Impacts of digital display on images of shopping mall and atmosphere are influenced by audio and video contents and location of screens (Dennis, 2014).

# H1: There is significant relationship of Digital Display Location with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.:

# **Digital Display Content:**

The Content of Digital Display is most important to attract customers, if the Content is relevant and important it increases customer attraction and focus and also increases customer experience. The Content Provide the promotional information, information of product availability, choices, offers, highlights of stores, Brands, Quality of Products, Celebrity endorsement, ambience are important elements to consider while developing the Content for Digital Displays.

The content provided by price promotional and non-price related content. To explicate the effectiveness of digital displays, we examined the impact of varying content in Study 3. These results demonstrate that providing content that highlights price promotional elements, rather than non-price content, increases sales, the number of items purchased, and the time spent in the store. Customer psyche is very much important to understand. It totally depends upon consumer intention towards purchase decision which is based on satisfaction. If the customer is satisfied with brands then definitely, he or she will purchase again. Trust is the main factor which is derived from the loyalty services it also builds brand equity. In the shopping mall, customers try to get those products of renowned brands which are reliable. Consumer gets attracted because of trust and reliability (Ahmad, 2012).

The Digital Displays enhance the store environment and increase attraction of customers

by increasing information and providing details of current promotion thus this effect on consumer's decisions and impacts on sales (Burke, 2009). These screens can also display other information to customers. As retailers face increasing competition from Amazon and other ecommerce providers, digital signage has become a key focus to help to increase sales (Roster, 2012).

# H2: There is significant relationship of Digital Display Content with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls:

### **Environment of Shopping Mall:**

The Environment of Shopping Malls is Significant and important factor to consider and customer's attraction is very important for marketers and Business People. The Environment of Mall includes the Shopping facilities, Location, Parking, Entertainment facilities for Children and so forth. Environment is one the major factor in terms of customer satisfaction because this attributes to enhance consumer mind to intact with this environment which gives benefit to the shopping mall by gaining emotional attachment (William, 2006). Meanwhile, emotional factor also contributed at a very large scale in which customer emotionally attached with pleasurable environment. When we are talking about emotional factor, ambiance is one of the essential variables for the emotional factor and shopping malls are having advantage this variable by adding more values in it (You & Yu, 2006). Environment is counted as one of competitive tool for the shopping malls because it creates a positive impact to facilitate customers and increases level of customer and increases of visual levels that leads to the customer satisfaction on high level (Kworthnik& Ross, 2007). In Pakistan, there are lots of shopping malls that have been inaugurated due to increase customer level like Atrium Mall in which many shops are available there, even food chains with children play area and cinema for the entertainment, such kind of activities attract consumer to visit regularly and engage them in entertainment activities.

# **H3:** There is significant relationship of Environment of Shopping malls with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls:

### Size of Digital Display:

The Digital Displays Size is considerably an important Factor, as marketing and advertising takes place where the things easily shown to customers. The Size enhances the image and experience with location and customer gets engaged in advertising. The study is to examine the impact of the digital display size. The 42 inches digital display screen size is effective in the hypermarkets, but it has not affected the superstores. It is possible that a screen smaller than 42 inches might be more effective in a store with a smaller footprint.

The retention of customer is challenging task for the marketers. The repetitive visits and buying shows the consumer loyalty towards shopping malls and specific brands. The preferences towards shopping malls are due to marketing efforts and brands recognition. In particular, loyalty may be defined as a customer's intention or predisposition to purchase from the same brand again (Edvardsson et al., 2000). The shopper's loyalty towards shopping malls depends on image, ambience, facilities, services; environment and social factor are become very important.

Hefer & Cant (2013), similar findings are also noticeable in Breugelman's and Campo's (2011) study. Most of the ineffectiveness stems from the advertising, confusion of shelf tag displays. Instead, the focus should again be on exclusive and isolated display positions. Thus, future research should examine the impact of varying the screen size of the digital display in

different store formats.

# H4: There is significant relationship of Size of Digital Display with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.

## **Size of Shopping Mall:**

In considering the effects of display content, we did not explore interactive content, which represents an important avenue for additional research. Split screens that display both price promotions and information about the product might increase the novelty of the screens themselves, which would get more interest and attention from consumers. In this sense, additional research should consider various ways to increase the sense of novelty surrounding the screens.

In shopping mall context, various researchers have found a set of service factors that impact on consumer behavioral intentions. Some of these are discussed as there is a major impact on the consumer responses with relation to the atmospheric music. Customers react differently to different type of music. The customer's perceived value is significantly influenced due to pleasant ambient fragrance. Moreover, the customers also spend more time in the store due to pleasant odor (Kumar, Garg, and Rahman, 2010). Also, in scented conditions it influences on the emotions of the consumers pleasure, arousal and making them feel that they have spent less time in a store as compare to non-scented environment (Spangenberg et al., 1996).

The variables selected based on literature review explained by various authors. The Independent variables are the Environment of Shopping mall, Content of Digital Displays, Place or Location, Digital Display Size and Size of Shopping malls are considerably important factors to evaluate the Sales of organizations as these effects on purchase decisions and ultimately affect the sales of brand. Digital display's advertising effectiveness depend on both content of the message (appeal type and product category) and the context and quality of exposure (audience need state, traffic speed and direction, message frequency and duration.

# H5: There is significant relationship of Size of Shopping Mall with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls:

#### **Theoretical Framework:**

The research attempt to explain the role of Digital Displays on Consumer Purchase behavior and how it changes the mind of customer while visits in Shopping Malls. The Theory of impulse buying behavior explains the phenomena of change in consumer behavior based on impulses and present availability of products and services (Beatty and Farrel, 1988). The Digital Displays are the source of advertising used in all large shopping malls to increase consumer awareness towards new arrivals in clothing and various brands that increase consumer knowledge of products and services, to attract customer within stores or shopping malls and consumers are willing to buy those products which increase the sales of Brands and shopping malls.

The Digital Display is effective source proven in various countries and empirical researches includes the study of Bruke (2009) and (Roster, 2012). Digital Displays enhance the store environment and increase attraction of customers by increasing information and providing details of current promotion thus this effect on consumer's decisions and impacts on sales (Burke, 2009). The various researches conducted to evaluate the retail formats and store size also credible factor, to influence the behavior of consumers (Grewal et al, 2011).

### **Conceptual Framework:**

The research conducted based on selected variables based on Literature review. The Variables are Display Location, Display Content and Store Environment and Sales of Brands available in Shopping mall is Dependent Variable.

Digital Display Location / Place

Digital Display Content

Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls
Environment

Size of Digital Display

Size of Supermarket / Shopping Mall

Figure 1: Conceptual Framework<sup>1</sup>

The above figure framework shows the selection of variables and variables are selected based on literature review explained by various authors. The Independent variables are the Environment of Shopping mall, Content of Digital Displays, Location, Digital Display Size and size of Shopping malls are considerably important factors to evaluate the Sales of organizations as these effects on purchase decisions and ultimately affects the sales of organization.

Digital display's advertising effectiveness depends on both the content of the message (appeal type and product category) and the context and quality of exposure (audience need state, traffic speed and direction, message frequency and duration. Digital display positively impacts shoppers' approach behaviors (e.g., spending). This impact is mediated by perceptions of the retail environment and positive affect. Impacts of digital display on images of shopping mall and atmosphere are influenced by audio and video contents and location of screens.

## **Hypothesis Development:**

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Source: Adapted: Newman (2010), Dennis et al (2014), Dennis et al (2014), Grewel et al (2011)

H1: There is significant relationship of Digital Display Location with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.

H2: There is significant relationship of Digital Display Content with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.

H3: There is significant relationship of Environment of Shopping malls with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.

H4: There is significant relationship of Size of Digital Display with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.

H5: There is significant relationship of Size of Shopping Mall with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.

# Research Framework and Methodology:

## **Research Design:**

The research designs explain the distinction between selection of Quantitative and Qualitative approaches of research. The research will be conducted in Post-Positivism research paradigm, which reflects the Stance of research to conduct a research Saunders, Lewis, & Thornhill, 2009). The Research Conducted with Quantitative approach and data collected based through Questionnaires.

The Philosophy research adopted is Epistemology to conduct a research to increase the knowledge and build on existing theory under Post Positivism research Paradigm. The Research will explain the impact of Digital Display on Sales of various brands within the shopping malls. The research approach explains the relationship between a theory and research work (Bryman and Bell, 2011). This research will be conducted under the deductive research approach, research explain specific reasons and made Generalization based on results from selected approach.

#### **Research Data Collection:**

The research data Collected through Questionnaire. The Survey based on Self-Administered Questionnaire from customers of large shopping malls. The Sample will be Customers of Shopping malls and research will be conducted through visiting Shopping malls where digital screens launched and also where can be launched to evaluate the customers perspective and its impact on sales.

### **Population of Study:**

The Research will be conducted based on Probability Sampling. The Simple random Sampling will be used to collect the Data through Questionnaire.

### **Research Population:**

The Population of research will be the Customers visiting in big Shopping malls and few shopping malls will be selected based on where screens are available and customer frequently visiting the malls.

# **Sampling Method:**

The Probability Sampling is used in this research and in Probability Simple random Sampling will be used to collect data from respondents who visit big shopping malls for frequent purchasing.

### **Sample Size:**

The Sample Size selected based on large Population and 95% confidence Interval and 5% Margin of Error the Sample size will 385 Customers (Parke and Rea, 2006). The Sample will be representative of the total Population and as study is deductive generalization will be possible.

### **Research Instrument:**

The Research will be conducted based on theory and Instrument is design on Likert Scale over fixed responses. The Self-Administered Survey Questionnaire used to collect data of respondents who visits the large Shopping malls for purchasing. The respondents were asked related Questions of Digital Display Place, Content, Size, Environment of Malls and Size of Shopping mall to the change in behavior and Impact on Sales of particular Brands and Shopping Mall.

# **Research Findings and Analysis:**

The research conducted to evaluate the relationship and impact of Digital Displays Advertising on Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls. The Shopping centers create value for customers in various aspects and increase customer satisfaction and loyalty. There are various shopping malls in Karachi and offering variety of services in terms on products and brands availability, environment of shopping malls, entertainment facilities. The Digital Displays are the source of information and advertising to influence consumer behavior in shopping malls so that's consumers is intended to buy the products and services.

The Digital Displays Place or location, Content, Size of Displays, Place of Display and Size of Stores and Shopping Malls. This research elaborates the Digital Display the Consumer Buying Behavior and alternatively affects the Sales of organization. The Consumers having various choices to buy the product and Services and consumer who are unintended to buy with planning they looking forward for discounts, new collection, sale of product and services and purchase the product and services.

The Quantitative research conducted by survey the shopping malls and collect Responses from people regarding the impact of Digital Displays on consumer buying behavior. The data collected based on random sampling and confidence interval 95%, the data of 385 sample size collected. The data collected from major 4 shopping malls of Karachi based on various Geographic regions. The data collected from various demographics, geographic region, age and education of people.

The collected data processed through SPSS Software and analyzed based on reliability tests, correlation analysis, regression analysis and hypothesis testing. The research questions answered through conceptual framework and development of hypothesis as research explains the Digital Displays have significant impact on sales of shopping malls. If Size, Content, Place of Display and size of Shopping malls are effective it surely affects the sales of organization.

## **Demographics of Respondents:**

**Table 1 Demographics of respondents** 

Demographics of Respondents						
		Female				
Gender		162				
	18-25 Years 26-33 Years		33- 40 Years			
Age	38 205		142			
	Intermediate Gradate		Post-Graduate			
Education	8	186	191			
	Student Government / Private Job		Business			
Profession	38	156	191			

The data collected from the visitors of various shopping malls in Karachi and both males and females are the participants of research. The 223 respondents are males and 162 respondents are females from the sample of 385. The Data collected based on Probability simple random Sampling and respondents are vary in terms of age as well, the core participants of research are the 26 to 33 years major portion is youth. The 38 respondents are 18 to 25 years, and 34 to 40 years of age are 142 respondents.

The respondents were asked for the educated and many of responded are the Graduate and Post Gradated, because they keen to understand the services and have opinion regarding the customer loyalty. The 186 respondents are the Graduate are 191 respondents are Post graduate and only 8 respondents are the undergraduate. The respondents vary in terms of Profession so that have respondents from all the profession includes the 38 are students and 156 are the people who are doing business and 200 respondents who are doing private or government Job are the respondents of this research.

### **Reliability Testing and Analysis:**

**Table 2 Scale Measurement of Collected Data** 

Variables	Items	Cronbach's Alpha
Digital Display Location / Place	5	0.74
Digital Display Content	5	0.82
Environment of Shopping Mall	5	0.75
Size of Digital Display	5	0.76
Size of Supermarket / Shopping Mall	5	0.81
Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls	5	0.78

The above table shows the results of internal reliability test. The values of Cronbach's alpha show the results of reliability as the values are greater than 70% shows the better reliability (Saunders, 2011). The reliability means shows the internal consistency of responses and its performed to analyze the responses are consistent over the scale. The pilot testing was conducted and 40 respondent's data was collected to perform the reliability analysis. That shows the reliability of that value of Cronbach's alpha must be greater than 0.6 of 60% shows the responses over the scale and questionnaire having internal consistency. The first variable Digital Display Location, with 5 statements asked and value of Cronbach Alpha is 0.74 shows better internal consistency of response. The Second Variables Digital Display Content with value of Cronbach Alpha is 0.82, the third Variable Size of Digital Display Size value of Conbachs Alpha is 0.64 and Size of Digital Display value is 0.76, Size of Shopping Mall is 0.81 and Dependent Impact of

variable Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls is 0.78. All the constructs values are greater than 0.7 are considerably reliable over the scale and statements and responses are internally valid to conduct the data analysis to perform correlation and regression analysis to evaluate the results.

# **Significance of Variables through Correlation Matrix:**

**Table 3 Correlation Matrix with Dependent variables** 

		DD Location	DD Content	Environment of Shopping	DD Size	Size of Shopping Mall	Sales
DD Location	Pearson Correlation	1	.566**	064	.035	.193**	.312**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.000	.209	.490	.000	.000
	N	385	385	385	385	385	385
DD Content	Pearson Correlation	.566**	1	.318**	.147**	.260**	.347**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000		.000	.004	.000	.000
	N	385	385	385	385	385	385
Environment of Shopping	Pearson Correlation	064	.318**	1	.552**	.717**	.416**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.209	.000		.000	.000	.000
	N	385	385	385	385	385	385
DD Size	Pearson Correlation	.035	.147**	.552**	1	.790**	.830**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.490	.004	.000		.000	.000
	N	385	385	385	385	385	385
Size of Shopping Mall	Pearson Correlation	.193**	.260**	.717**	.790**	1	.520**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.000	.000	.000		.000
	N	385	385	385	385	385	385
Sales	Pearson Correlation	.312**	.347**	.416**	.830**	.520**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.000	.000	.000	.000	
	N	385	385	385	385	385	385

<sup>\*\*.</sup> Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

The correlation Analysis shows the relationship between the Quantitative terms. The Correlation analysis describes the magnitude and direction of relationship through Pearson values

and significance values 2 tailed. The Pearson values in normal range are 0.2 to 0.8. The Multicollinearity analyzed the relationship among independent variables. The Pearson value of Digital Displays Content and Environment of Mall -0.64 shows the negative relationship as Environment of Malls. The Person value .193 in Size of Shopping Mall and Environment is low shows very low connection of Digital Displays Content and size of shopping mall, as Content may connected with Environment, Size of Display but not with size of shopping mall. The Pearson value .147 between the Digital Display Size and Content which is also very low shows less connection and no interrelated influence between these two variables.

The independent variables are the Digital Displays Content, Digital Display Size, Digital Display Place or location, Environment of Shopping Malls, Size of Shopping Malls and Dependent Variable is Sales of Organization who performs the marketing and advertising through the Digital Displays. The Correlation Matrix explains the relationship of selected independent variables with dependent variable. The Correlation explains at 95% confidence interval probability values of Digital Displays Content, Digital Display Size, Digital Display Place or location, Environment of Shopping Malls, Size of Shopping Malls and Dependent Variable is Sales of Organization who performs the marketing and advertising through the Digital Displays values are 0.00 which are less than 0.05 which confirms the significant positive relationship with Sales in Brands in Shopping Malls.

## **Hypothesis Testing (Correlative Hypothesis):**

**Table 4 Alternative Hypothesis** 

Alternative Hypothesis	Significant level (Probability value)	Accepted / Rejected
H1: There is significant relationship of Digital Display Location with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.	.00	Accepted
H2: There is significant relationship of Digital Display Content with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.	.00	Accepted
H3: There is significant relationship of Environment of Shopping malls with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.	.00	Accepted
H4: There is significant relationship of Size of Digital Display with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.	.00	Accepted
H5: There is significant relationship of Size of Shopping Mall with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.	.00	Accepted

The tables shows the all the independent variables having probability value less than 0.05 which shows that variables having positive and significant relationship with dependent variable. The Variables Digital Displays Content, Digital Display Size, Digital Display Place or location, Environment of Shopping Malls, Size of Shopping Malls and Dependent Variable is Sales of Organization who performs the marketing and advertising through the Digital Displays are significant and role of Digital Displays is confirm through Quantitative Research.

### Analyzing relationship of variables with Multiple Regression:

The Regression analysis explain the predictability of independent variables to explain changes in dependent variables. The Digital Displays Content, Digital Display Size, Digital Display Place or location, Environment of Shopping Malls, Size of Shopping Malls and Dependent

Variable is Sales of Organization who performs the marketing and advertising through the Digital Displays are independent variables and Sales of organization is core construct to analyze.

**Table 5 Regression Model Summary** 

		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients		
	Model	В	Std. Error	Beta	t	Sig.
1	(Constant)	.027	.051		.532	.595
	DD Location	.459	.025	.415	3.683	.000
	DD Content	.052	.031	.036	2.688	.009
	Environment of Shopping	.208	.019	.289	10.944	.000
	DD Size	.854	.018	1.260	8.271	.000
	Size of Shopping Mall	.597	.026	.771	2.834	.000

## **Dependent Variable: Digital Displays impact on Sales:**

The tables show the values of Beta, t statistics and probability value of each Variables. The Unstandardized beta values explain the impact of independent variables on dependent variables. The value of t Statistics shows acceptance and rejection of hypothesis and probability values explains the significance level with acceptance and rejection. The Digital Display location Beta coefficient explains only 45% changes in Sales and variables is Significant with t statistics value 3.68 and probability values is less than 0.05 under the criteria of Confidence Interval and Margin of Error. The Digital Display Content is very important dimension the content theoretical also important reflects the new arrivals, offers, sales and discounts on various brands shows the Beta 0.052 explains the 5.2% changes caused due to this variable and t statistics shows the value 2.68. The Environment of Malls with Beta value 0.208 explains the 20.8% variation in sales due to shopping malls services and facilities and t statistics also significant with 10.94. The Digital Display size is also significant with Beta 0.85 and t statistics 8.2 finally the shopping mall size is also important construct with Beta 0.597 explains the 26% variation in Sales and t statistics also significant at 2.83.

**Table 6 Regression Model Summary** 

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.953	.908	.906	.14174

The R Square shows the predictability of model and how much variables explains the independent variables together. The model R Square is 0.90 variables all together explain the main

construct that is dependent variable. The Model predictability is very good in this model that's explains for Digital Displays these factors are most important and by considering these variables to evaluate the impact on sales in these shopping Malls.

**Table 7 ANOVA Analysis** 

	Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	74.796	5	14.959	44.589	$.000^{a}$
	Residual	7.614	379	.020	i.	li
	Total	82.410	384			

The tables shows the analysis of Variances and model significant test, F Statistics shows the model is Significant and probability is less than 0..05. The overall independent variables explain the dependent variables in all aspects of purchasing behavior and patter.

# **Hypothesis Testing (Regression)**

**Table 8 Alternative Hypothesis** 

Alternative Hypothesis	T Statistics	Significant level	Accepted / Rejected
H1: There is significant relationship of Digital Display Location with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.	3.071	18.683	.000
H2: There is significant relationship of Digital Display Content with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.	3.369	2.688	.009
H3: There is significant relationship of Environment of Shopping malls with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.	1.156	10.944	.000
H4: There is significant relationship of Size of Digital Display with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.	14.099	8.271	.000
H5: There is significant relationship of Size of Shopping Mall with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls.	4.293	2.834	.000

The above tables shows the results of hypothesis testing of regression the impact hypothesis, the results shows all the independent variables having value greater than 1.96 of t statistics and probability value less than 0.05 shows the variables having Significant relationship and impact of Digital Displays Content, Digital Display Size, Digital Display Place or location, Environment of Shopping Malls, Size of Shopping Malls and Dependent Variable is Sales of Organization who performs the marketing and advertising through the Digital Displays on Sales of shopping malls.

### **Conclusion:**

The research summarizes the relationship and impact of Digital Display Advertising impacts on Sales of Brands. The Digital Displays is current modern phenomena and marketers use as adverting tool to increase customer information and awareness towards the products and

services. The Consumer Buying pattern can be changed in unplanned behavior and Digital Displays in stores and shopping malls are increasing in current practices. The Sales in organizations influenced with many factors the one of prominent factor is advertising. The role of advertising is changing due to changing dynamics of social media and digital age. The digital age provides a lot of edge to retailers and it can increase the customer's attention for purchase of product. In Pakistan this concept is very new and in big Shopping malls digital displays are installed on the concept borrowed from US large stores TESCO and Carrefour. The empirical researches elaborate the Significant relationship and impact of Digital Displays Advertising on Sales through considering the important factors includes the Digital Display Size, Location, Place of Display, Size of Shopping Malls and Environment of Shopping malls are important factors these affects the convey of information and creating customer awareness towards products and services.

The research conducted through Self-Administered Questionnaire from the Customers of big Shopping Malls and respondents show the variety of responses and researcher perform the various tests to analyze the correlation of few factors and their impact on Sales. The Independent Variables selected based on literature are the Digital Display Location, Size, Content, Size of Shopping Mall and Environment of Shopping Malls. These factors are theoretically empirical, researches prove that if the location was not proper it has seen no impact on Sales, if their Content was not proper no impact were seen and Where Place, Size, Content are very relevant consumer willing to spend some more time and increase some buying as well that overall increase the Sales of Shopping Mall.

The research results reveal that there is Significant relationship and impact of Digital Displays Location, Content, Size on Sales of Brands with consideration of Shopping Malls Characteristics with big Shopping Malls and Environment of Mall must be customer friendly. The Small Shopping stores and Malls Digital Displays do not work and customers are less intended to view the Digital Displays.

The Correlation Analysis Shows that all the independent variables includes the Digital Displays Content, Digital Display Size, Digital Display Place or location, Environment of Shopping Malls, Size of Shopping Malls having probability value less than 0.05 which shows that variables having positive and significant relationship with dependent variable. The Regression Analysis applied to evaluate the impact of selected variables on Sales of organization and Brands, the results shows that Digital Display location Beta coefficient explains only 2.5% changes in Sales and variables is Significant with t statistics value 3.68, Digital Display Content is very important dimension the content theoretical also very important reflects the new arrivals, offers, sales and discounts on various brands shows the Beta 0.31 explains the 31% changes caused due to this variable and t statistics shows the value 2.68. The Environment of Malls with Beta value 0.19 explains the 19% variation in sales due to shopping malls services and facilities and t statistics also significant with 10.94. The Digital Display size is also significant with Beta 0.18 and t statistics 8.2 finally the shopping mall size is also important construct with Beta 0.26 explains the 26% variation in Sales and t statistics also significant at 2.83. All the Beta Coefficient and t statistics are significant and shows the positive impact of these factors with Sales of Brands in Shopping Malls and Alternative hypothesis are accepted, based on Impulsive Buying Behavior theory.

### **Implications of Research:**

The research conducted in the domain of marketing and focused on Services marketing. The research is very relevant and useful for the shopping malls to understand the customer needs

and improve the customer satisfaction of customers in Shopping malls. The Digital Display marketing is very effective tool to evaluate and analyses the impact on Sales. This research is helpful for markets to analyses the importance of Digital Displays Advertising and core factors considered while installing the Digital Displays in Shopping Malls. The Brands and Entrepreneurs also take the advantage of this research to evaluate the importance and Implement this modern advertising strategy in large Shopping Malls and stores.

### **Areas of Further Research:**

The research scope is limited to services marketing and shopping malls of Karachi. The research results recommend that business people must work on facilities of shopping malls and create facilities of customers like availability of brands, parking facility, security, safety and environment. The Launch of Digital Displays is the most recent Phenomena in Pakistan and Brands and Business people take advantage of this retailing strategy to increase customer awareness and information and proved as most useful place for advertising and invest in advertising. The research explains the role of Digital Displays Location, Content which was explained by other researchers in US, though this research highlights the Size of Display, Size of Shopping Mall are very important constructs while Advertising through Digital Displays. The Future areas of research can be to evaluate the facilities in Shopping Malls, Brands Availability, Proper location and based on Needs of customers these factors are also important to consider while focus on Advertising through Digital Display.

### References

- Adly, M., (2007). Shopping malls attractiveness: a segmentation approach. International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management, 35(11), 936-950.
- Anne L. R., Jens Nordfält b, Dhruv Grewal (2015), Do Digital Displays Enhance Sales? Role of Retail Format and Message Content, Journal of retailing
- Beatty, S. E., & Ferrell, M. E. (1998). Impulse buying: Modeling its precursors. Journal of retailing, 74(2), 169-191.
- Bell, D., Daniel, C. and George, K. (2011), "From Point-of-Purchase to Path-to-Purchase: How PreShopping Factors Drive Unplanned Buying," Journal of Marketing, 75, 31–45.
- Bhattacharya, Sen, and C.B (2003) "Consumer Company Identification: A Framework for understanding consumer's relationships with Companies" Journal of Marketing, Vol 67, (April), PP. 76-88.
- Bryman, A., & Bell, E. (2011). Business research methods (3rd ed.). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Burke, R. (2009), "Behavioral Effects of Digital Signage," *Journal of Advertising Research*, (June), 180–5.
- Chandon, P., Hutchinson, J., Bradlow, E. and Young, S (2009), "Does in-store marketing work? Effects of the number and position of shelf facings on brand attention and evaluation at the point of purchase", Journal of Marketing, Vol. 73 No. 6, pp. 1-17

- Creswell, J. W. (2009). Research design. Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Dennis, Charles, Andrew Newman, Michon Richard, J. Josko Brakus and Len Tiu Wright (2010), "The Mediating Effects of Perception and Emotion: Dig- ital Signage in Mall Atmospherics," Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, 17, 205–15.
- Dennis, Charles, Richard Michon, J. Josko Brakus, Andrew Newman and Eleft-herios Alamanos (2012), "New Insights into the Impact of Digital Signage as a Retail Atmospheric Tool," *Journal of Consumer Behaviour*, 11 (6), 454–66.
- Ganesh, Jaishankar, Kristy Reynolds and Michael Luckett (2007), "Retail Patronage Behavior and Shopper Typologies: A Replication and Extension Using a Multi-format, Multi-method Approach," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 35 (3), 369–81.
- Grewal, levy, Verhoefetal (2009) "An organizing framework- Customer experience management in retailing" "Journal of retailing" Vol 85, No. 1, PP.1-14
- Grewal, Dhruv, Kusum Ailawadi, Dinesh Gauri, Kevin Hall, Praveen Kopalle and Jane Robertson (2011), "Innovation in Retail Pricing and Promotions," *Journal of Retailing*, 87S (1), S43–52.
- Lang, M (2015), The effects of special displays on shopping behavior", Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, vol. 23, pp. 125-132.
- Newman, A., Charles, D. and Zaman, S. (2006), "Marketing Images and Consumers' Experiences in Selling Environments," Marketing Management Journal, (Fall), 515–99.
- Newman, Michon Richard, J. Josko Brakus and Len Tiu Wright (2010), "The Mediating Effects of Perception and Emotion: Digital Signage in Mall Atmospherics," Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, 17, 205–15.
- Nordfalt, J. (2011). Improving the attention-capturing ability of special displays with the combination effect and the design effect, Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, vol. 18, no. 3, pp. 169-173.
- Parker & Rea, (2011). Designing and conducting research; Quantitative research inquiry selecting a sample size, Sage Publications.
- Raut, M., & Das, S. K., (2011). The factors predicting buying behavior in organized retailing: a study with special reference to malls in Noida and Greater Noida. International Journal of Business and Management Tomorrow, 1(3), 1-10.
- Roggeveen, A.L., Nordfält, J. & Grewal, D (2016), Do Digital Displays Enhance Sales? Role of Retail Format and Message Content", Journal of Retailing, vol. 92, no. 1, pp. 122-131.
- Rook, D. W. (1987). The buying impulse. Journal of consumer research, 14(2), 189-199.
- Rosbergen, E., Pieters, R. and Wedel, M (1997), Visual attention to advertising: a segment level analysis, Journal of Consumer Research, Vol. 24, No. 3, pp. 305-314

- Roster, Jeffrey (2012), "Market Insight: Retail Primer, North America," *Gartner Report*, March 29, 1–21.
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P., & Thornhill, A. (2009). Research methods for business students (5th ed.). Harlow, UK: FT Prentice Hall.
  - Stilley, M., Jeffrey J. and Kirk L. (2010), Spending on the Fly: Mental Budgets, Promotions, and Spending Behavior, Journal of Marketing, (2), 34–47.
- Solomon, M.R., Bamossy, G., Askegaard, S. & Hogg, M.K (2006), Consumer behavior: a European perspective, 3 rd ed. edn, Financial Times/Prentice-Hall, Harlow.